



Faculty of Electrical Engineering

**DESIGN AND ANALYSIS ON THE ROBUST CONTROL OF A X-Y
BALLSCREW MECHANISM**

Hee Wai Keat

Master of Science in Mechatronics Engineering

2016

**DESIGN AND ANALYSIS ON THE ROBUST CONTROL OF A X-Y BALLSCREW
MECHANISM**

HEE WAI KEAT

**A thesis submitted
In fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science
in Mechatronics Engineering**

Faculty of Electrical Engineering

UNIVERSITI TEKNIKAL MALAYSIA MELAKA

2016

DECLARATION

I declare that this thesis entitled “Design and analysis on the robust control of a *X-Y* ballscrew mechanism” is the result of my own research except as cited in the references. The thesis has not been accepted for any degree and is not concurrently submitted in candidature of any other degree.

Signature :

Name : HEE WAI KEAT

Date :

APPROVAL

I hereby declare that I have read this thesis and in my opinion this thesis is sufficient in terms of scope and quality for the award of Master of Science in Mechatronic Engineering.

Signature :

Name : DR. CHONG SHIN HORNG

Date :

DEDICATION

To my beloved father, mother and brother.

ABSTRACT

This thesis presents the design and analysis on the robust control of a X - Y ballscrew mechanism. In this research, a practical and robust controller for positioning control is discussed. The Continuous Motion Nominal Characteristic Trajectory Following (CM NCTF) controller is investigated in this research for tracking motion of an AC driven X - Y ballscrew mechanism. The CM NCTF controller has a simple control structure and straightforward design procedure that does not require an exact model parameter of a plant. In order to enhance the accuracy of the control system, a suitable input signal is designed to make sure the X - Y ballscrew mechanism attenuate smoothly in the deceleration motion. The CM NCTF controller consists of a Nominal Characteristic Trajectory (NCT) and a Proportional and Integral (PI) compensator. The NCT is constructed using the open-loop experimental responses while the PI compensator is designed based on a practical stability limit obtained experimentally. The CM NCTF controller has been evaluated in tracking motion performance. In order to examine the adaptability of the controller to the change of the input, experiments with various inputs is carried out. Besides that, the robustness of the controller is validated through the change of the load of the system. In order to examine the usefulness of the CM NCTF controller, a PI-D controller that has a similar control structure is designed and compared. The tracking performance of the CM NCTF controller is evaluated in maximum peak error E_{max} , percentage of error $E_{percent}$, and root mean square of error E_{rms} . E_{max} is the difference between the output peak and the reference input, and $E_{percent}$ is the percentage of the peak error with respect to the reference input. The experimental results proved that the CM NCTF controller has demonstrated better positioning response than the conventional NCTF controller and the PI-D controller by showing a two times smaller motion error. The robustness of the CM NCTF controller is clarified using X -axis, which has heavier load than the Y -axis. The experimental results have again proved that the CM NCTF controller demonstrates better tracking performance than the conventional NCTF controller and the PI-D controller in X -axis. As a conclusion, the CM NCTF controller has better positioning performance as compared to the conventional NCTF controller and PI-D controller. In future, the contour motion for X -axis and Y -axis will be done to evaluate accuracy of the controller. Besides that, the robustness performance in term of change of disturbance force will be considered.

ABSTRAK

Tesis ini membincangkan rekabentuk dan analisis pengawal berciri mantap pada mekanisma skru bebola X-Y. Dalam penyelidikan ini, satu pengawal yang praktikal dan teguh untuk kawalan gerakan mekanisma telah dibincangkan. Pengawal gerakan berterusan mengikut ciri nominal trajektori (CM NCTF) disiasat dalam penyelidikan ini untuk gerakan pengesanan bagi mekanisma skru bebola X-Y yang digerakkan oleh motor AC. Pengawal CM NCTF mempunyai struktur kawalan yang mudah dan tatacara rekabentuk yang senang untuk difaham, di mana pengawal ini tidak perlu mengetahui parameter model yang tepat. Untuk mengetahui kejituan sistem kawalan, masukan yang sesuai untuk mekanisme skru bebola X-Y telah direka. Tujuan masukan ini direka adalah untuk memastikan mekanisma tidak menurun secara mendadak. Pengawal CM NCTF terdiri daripada ciri nominal trajektori (NCT) dan pemampas berkadar serta kamiran (PI). NCT dibina menggunakan jawapan eksperimen yang diperolehi daripada sistem gelung terbuka manakala pemampas PI direka berdasarkan had kestabilan praktikal yang diperolehi secara eksperimen. Pengawal CM NCTF telah dinilai dengan menjejaki gerakan yang diusul. Bagi memeriksa kebolehsuaian pengawal dengan perubahan masukan, eksperimen dengan pelbagai jenis masukan telah dijalankan. Selain itu, keteguhan pengawal telah disahkan melalui perubahan beban sistem (paksi-Y dan paksi-X). Bagi memeriksa keberkesanan pengawal CM NCTF, pengawal PI-D yang mempunyai struktur kawalan yang serupa telah direka bentuk dan dibandingkan. Ralat puncak maksimum E_{max} , peratusan ralat $E_{percent}$ and punca kuasa dua min ralat E_{rms} telah digunakan untuk menyesahkan penyesuaian pengawal CM NCTF. E_{max} ialah hasil pembezaan keluaran puncak dengan masukan rujukan, dan $E_{percent}$ ialah peratusan ralat puncak dengan masukan rujukan. Hasil percubaan eksperimen telah membuktikan bahawa pengawal CM NCTF menunjukkan kawalan gerakan yang dua kali lebih baik daripada pengawal konvensional NCTF dan pengawal PI-D dengan menunjukkan ralat usul lebih kecil. Keteguhan pengawal CM NCTF telah diuji pada paksi-X yang lebih berat berbanding dengan paksi-Y. Daripada keputusan eksperimen didapati bahawa pengawal CM NCTF lebih teguh berbanding dengan pengawal konvensional NCTF dan pengawal PI-D. Kesimpulannya, pengawal CM NCTF mempunyai prestasi yang lebih baik berbanding dengan konvensional NCTF dan pengawal PI-D. Pada masa akan datang, gerakan kontur untuk paksi-X dan paksi-Y akan dilakukan untuk menilai ketepatan pengawal. Selain itu, prestasi keteguhan dari segi perubahan daya gangguan akan dipertimbangkan.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First of all, I would like to take this opportunity to express my acknowledgement especially to my supervisor, Dr. Chong Shin Horng from Faculty of Electrical Engineering, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka for her supervision, guidance, comment, and encouragement towards the completion of this research.

Here, I also would like to express my gratitude to my co-supervisor, Dr Aliza bte Che Amran from Faculty of Electrical Engineering, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka and all group members of Motion Control Research Laboratory (MCon) namely Mr. Arman Hadi, Miss Rozilawati binti Mohd Nor, Mr. Abu Bakar, Mr. Vasanthan, Mr Alfred Tang Teng Fong, Mr Billy Tan Ming Hui and Miss Foo Jia En for their advices and suggestions during completing this research.

Special thanks and appreciation are expressed to Zamalah scholarship, Universiti Teknikal Malaysia Melaka (UTeM), and the Ministry of Higher Education (Malaysia) for sponsoring my studies.

Last but not least, I would like to thank my family, friends, and all staff UTeM for giving their full support, understanding and patience during this period.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
DECLARATION	
APPROVAL	
DEDICATION	
ABSTRACT	i
ABSTRAK	ii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS	iv
LIST OF TABLES	vi
LIST OF FIGURES	vii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xi
LIST OF SYMBOLS	xiii
LIST OF PUBLICATIONS	xvi
CHAPTER	
1. INTRODUCTION	
1.1. Background	1
1.2. Problem statement	3
1.3. Objectives	4
1.4. Scope of research	4
1.5. Significant of study	5
1.6. Thesis outline	6
2. LITERATURE REVIEW	
2.1. Introduction	7
2.2. Ballscrew mechanism	7
2.3. Control theory evolution in precise positioning system	10
2.4. NCTF background	17
2.5. Summary	29
3. METHODOLOGY	
3.1. Introduction	31
3.2. Experimental setup and system modelling	32
3.3. NCTF controller concepts	39
3.4. CM NCTF controller design procedures	42
3.4.1. Design of input signal	42
3.4.2. Open-loop response	44
3.4.3. Construction of NCT	45
3.4.4. Design of PI compensator	46
3.5. Summary	50
4. RESULT AND DISCUSSION	
4.1. Introduction	51
4.2. PI-D concepts and procedures	51
4.3. Sensitivity analysis	53
4.4. Tracking performance	55
4.5. Design of notch filter	77
4.6. Robustness evaluation	79

4.7.	Summary	98
5.	CONCLUSION AND FUTURE STUDY	
5.1.	Introduction	99
5.2.	Research summary	99
5.3.	Suggestion for future work	103
	REFERENCES	104

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE	TITLE	PAGE
4.1	Nominal Object Parameters	59
4.2	$E_{percent}$ of the CM NCTF controller, conventional NCTF controller and PI-D controller in Y -axis with variation of reference input	72
4.3	Tracking result of 10 times repeatability experiments with Y -axis	75
4.4	$E_{percent}$ of the CM NCTF controller, conventional NCTF controller and PI-D controller in X -axis with variation of reference input	93
4.5	Tracking result of 10 times repeatability experiments with X -axis	95

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE	TITLE	PAGE
2.1	Schematic diagram of a ballscrew assembly (Sepasi et al., 2012)	8
2.2	Air motor system (Lu and Hwang, 2012)	10
2.3	Ballscrew mechanism with DC servo motor (Huang et al., 2009)	17
2.4	NCTF control structure for PTP positioning (Wahyudi et al., 2001)	18
2.5	Rotary positioning system (Wahyudi et al., 2004)	19
2.6	Rotary positioning system (Purtojo et al., 2009)	21
2.7	Precision positioning mechanism with friction characteristic (Sato et al., 2004)	22
2.8	Ballscrew mechanism (Sato and Maeda, 2007)	23
2.9	Two-axis ballscrew mechanism (Sato and Maeda, 2009a)	24
2.10	1-DOF air slide mechanism (Chong and Sato, 2010a)	26
2.11	One Mass Rotary system (Rozilawati and Chong, 2013)	28
3.1	Research methodology phases	31
3.2	X-Y ballscrew mechanism	32
3.3	Micro-box 2000 (TeraSoft Inc., 2012)	33
3.4	Experiment setup connection	34
3.5	Free body diagram of ballscrew mechanism (macrodynamic characteristic)	34
3.6	Open-loop response of a ballscrew mechanism with Y-axis	37
3.7	Constructed NCT from open-loop response	38

3.8	Experimental magnitude plot of open-loop with <i>Y</i> -axis	39
3.9	Block diagram of Continuous Motion NCTF (CM NCTF) controller	40
3.10	Block diagram of conventional NCTF controller	40
3.11	Reaching phase and following phase in NCT	42
3.12	Stepwise input signal	43
3.13	Designed open-loop input signal	44
3.14	Experimental open-loop response with <i>Y</i> -axis of ballscrew system	45
3.15	Constructed NCT and magnified view at origin in <i>Y</i> -axis of ballscrew system	46
3.16	Linearised block diagram of ballscrew mechanism with conventional NCTF controller	47
3.17	Experimental practical stability limit of the CM NCTF and conventional NCTF controller with <i>X</i> -axis	49
3.18	Experimental practical stability limit of the CM NCTF and conventional NCTF controller with <i>Y</i> -axis	49
4.1	Block diagram of PI-D controller	52
4.2	Experimental point-to-point positioning performance of conventional NCTF and PI-D controller with <i>Y</i> -axis	53
4.3	General closed-loop block diagram	53
4.4	Simulated frequency response for sensitivity of all controllers	55
4.5	Experimental and simulation closed-loop frequency response with <i>Y</i> -axis	57
4.6	Open-loop block diagram of plant in simulation	58
4.7	Experimental result of amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	60
4.8	Experimental result of amplitude 1mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	61
4.9	Experimental result of amplitude 5mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	61

4.10	Experimental result of amplitude 10mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	62
4.11	E_{\max} versus amplitude of reference input with frequency 0.1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	63
4.12	Experimental result of amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	64
4.13	Experimental result of amplitude 1mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	64
4.14	Experimental result of amplitude 5mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	65
4.15	Experimental result of amplitude 10mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	66
4.16	E_{\max} versus amplitude of reference input with frequency 1Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	67
4.17	Experimental result of amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	68
4.18	Experimental result of amplitude 1mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	69
4.19	Experimental result of amplitude 5mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	70
4.20	Experimental result of amplitude 10mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	70
4.21	E_{\max} versus amplitude of reference input with frequency 5Hz with <i>Y</i> -axis	71
4.22	Percentage of average E_{\max} with 10 times repeatability with <i>Y</i> -axis	76
4.23	Tracking performance with amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis without notch filter	77
4.24	Tracking performance with amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis with addition of notch filter	78
4.25	Experimental and simulation closed-loop frequency response with <i>X</i> -axis	79

4.26	Experimental result of amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	81
4.27	Experimental result of amplitude 1mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	82
4.28	Experimental result of amplitude 5mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	82
4.29	Experimental result of amplitude 10mm and frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	83
4.30	E_{\max} versus amplitude of reference input with frequency 0.1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	84
4.31	Experimental result of amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	85
4.32	Experimental result of amplitude 1mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	85
4.33	Experimental result of amplitude 5mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	86
4.34	Experimental result of amplitude 10mm and frequency 1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	87
4.35	E_{\max} versus amplitude of reference input with frequency 1Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	88
4.36	Experimental result of amplitude 0.1mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	89
4.37	Experimental result of amplitude 1mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	90
4.38	Experimental result of amplitude 5mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	91
4.39	Experimental result of amplitude 10mm and frequency 5Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	91
4.40	E_{\max} versus amplitude of reference input with frequency 5Hz with <i>X</i> -axis	92
4.41	Percentage of average E_{\max} with 10 times repeatability with <i>X</i> -axis	97

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ABBREVIATION	DETAILS
ABSMC	Adaptive back-stepping sliding mode controller
AC	Analogue current
ADC	Analogue to digital converter
AR-CM NCTF	Acceleration Reference-CM NCTF
ASMC	Adaptive sliding mode controller
BSMC	Backstepping sliding mode controller
CAN	Controller area network
CFRNF	Chebyshev functional recurrent neuro-fuzzy network
CM NCTF	Continuous Motion Nominal Characteristic Trajectory Following
CNC	Computer numerical control
D/A	Digital to analogue
DAC	Digital to analogue converter
DC	Direct current
DOB	Disturbance observer
DOD	Drop on demand
DOF	Degree of freedom
DOFVSC	Disturbance observer based-filtered variable structure controller
EMECS	Electro mechanical engineering control system
GPIO	General-purpose input/output

I/O	Input/output
LAN	Local area network
MATLAB	Matrix laboratory
MFNCT	Modified fast NCT
MNCT	Modified NCT
NCT	Nominal Characteristic Trajectory
NCTF	Nominal Characteristic Trajectory Following
P	Proportional
P/PI	Proportional/Proportional Integral
PC	Personal computer
PD	Proportional Derivative
PDDO	Proportional Derivative with Disturbance Observer
PI	Proportional Integral
PID	Proportional Integral Derivative
PI-D	Proportional Integral – Derivative
PTP	Point-to-point
SMC	Sliding mode control
SRNF	Smooth robust nonlinear feedback
VCM	Voice coil motor

LIST OF SYMBOLS

SYMBOL	DETAILS
$X - Y$	- X-axis and Y-axis
τ	- Torque
ℓ	- Position
d	- Disturbance
π	- Pi (3.14159265359)
f_b	- Gain crossover frequency
f_{BW}	- Bandwidth or cut-off frequency
x	- Displacement
\dot{x}	- Velocity
x_r	- Reference input
M	- Mass
C_d	- Damping coefficient
K_m	- Motor force constant
u	- Input signal
t_f	- Stopping time
K	- Constant
x_f	- Final displacement
t_{start}	- Step up time

t_a	-	Step period
t_b	-	Exponential period
e^{-at}	-	Exponential ratio
K_p	-	Proportional gain
K_i	-	Integral gain
ξ	-	Zeta (Damping ratio)
ω_n	-	Natural frequency
K_{pu}	-	Ultimate proportional gain
E_{\max}	-	Maximum peak error
E_{percent}	-	Percentage of maximum peak error with reference input
E_{rms}	-	Root mean square error
emf	-	Electromagnetic force
K_a	-	Amplifier gain
K_t	-	Motor torque constant
J	-	Inertia
B	-	Damping coefficient
K_b	-	Back emf constant
$(\dot{x}_r - \dot{x})$ or \dot{e}	-	Error rate
β	-	Inclination near origin
m	-	Gradient

UNIT		DETAILS
rad	-	Radian
mm	-	Millimetre
rev	-	Revolution
μm	-	Micrometre
V	-	Voltage
Hz	-	Hertz
A	-	Ampere
kg	-	Kilogram
N	-	Newton
%	-	Percentage
s	-	Second
dB	-	Decibel

LIST OF PUBLICATIONS

JOURNALS

1. Ong, Y.-T., Chong, S.-H., and **Hee, W.-K.**, 2015. Positioning Control of XY Table Using 2-DOF PID Controller. *Applied Mechanics and Materials*, 761, pp.137–141.
2. Chong, S.-H., **Hee, W.-K.**, Foo, J.-E., Amran, A.C., 2015. Practical Control Method for a Positioning System: CM NCTF Control of a X-Y Ball Screw Mechanism. *International Review of Automatic Control (I.R.E.A.CO.)*. [Under Review] (SCOPUS INDEX Q2)
3. **Hee, W.-K.**, Chong, S.-H., Foo, Jia.-En, and Amran, A.C., 2015. Fast Tracking Performance of CM NCTF Controller Using X-Y Ball Screw Mechanism. *Jurnal Teknologi*. [Under Review] (SCOPUS INDEX Q3)

CONFERENCES

1. Chong, S.-H., **Hee, W.-K.**, and Sato, K., 2014. Positioning control of an X-Y table based on practical NCTF control. *12th International Conference on Motion and Vibration, MOVIC*. pp.1–9.
2. **Hee, W.-K.**, Chong, S.-H., and Amran, A.C., 2014. Selection of PI Compensator Parameters for NCTF Controller Based on Practical Stability Limit. *IEEE International Conference on Control System, Computing and Engineering*. Penang, Malaysia, pp.674–679.

3. Subari, H., Chong, S.-H, **Hee, W.-K**, Chong, W.-Y, Nawawi, M.R., and Othman, N., 2015. Investigation of Model Parameter Variation for Tension Control of A Multi Motor Wire Winding System. *ASIAN Control Conference (ASCC)*, pp.1-6.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

Positioning mechanism that widely used in manufacturing systems is always aiming high-precision positioning. Thus, positioning control system in industries has high demands on high-precision positioning in order to maintain the quality of the product. Most of the industrial mechanisms usually operate at high speed for high productivity. The demand of the controller, which is practical, easy to design, simple control structure, fast response, small or no overshoot, and high robustness performance is increasing from time to time. In reality, the engineers in industry prefer to use equipment which is able to produce good performance in order to maintain the high speed production. Hence, practical controller, which has a simple control structure, easy to design, high adaptivity, and robust to the change of plant parameters is always a solution that needed in industry.

The controller plays an important role in a system, because one of the goals of the controller is to achieve stability and robustness in the system. Besides that, the controller also is functioned to make sure the system is able to obtain the desired output which set by the user. Since each mechanism will require a controller to make sure the process is smooth, therefore the structure of the controller should be simple and easy to understand by any engineer. As the controller has a simple structure and simple design procedure, the employer will not require to spend more budget to hire the supplier as the mechanism changes its function.

Up to now many types of controllers have been proposed and evaluated for positioning systems; for example, proportional-integral-derivative (PID) controller. PID

controller is highly recommended and widely used by industrial field due to structural simplicity. With its three-term functionality, it is easy to be tuned and achieved effectiveness. However, PID controller has met the limitation when a higher positioning performance and robust systems are required. In order to achieve the better requirements, different types of controller have been proposed such as advance PID controller, disturbance observer (DOB), sliding mode control (SMC), and adaptive fuzzy controller. However, these advanced controllers require the exact model of the plant; which is time consuming to identify each parameter. It is difficult for engineer who is unfamiliar with advanced control to adjust and handle the control parameters in industrial. Besides that, these more complex advanced intelligent control methods such as disturbance observer based-filtered variable structure controller, friction compensation, adaptive back-stepping sliding mode controller, fuzzy-logic with deadzone compensator, and Chebyshev functional recurrent neuro-fuzzy network are less favourably under practical conditions and require high knowledge of control theory.

Nominal Characteristic Trajectory Following (NCTF) controller is proposed to overcome the problems stated above (Wahyudi et al., 2001). NCTF controller highlights the easy design procedure and simple structure. Besides that, exact model parameters are not required when designing NCTF controller. Therefore, less knowledge of control theory is required when designing NCTF controller.

In this research, *X-Y* ballscrew mechanism is used as an actuator to validate the effectiveness of the designed controller. The *X-Y* ballscrew mechanism is an automated machine which is able to provide a horizontal motion along *X*-axis and *Y*-axis. This application is commonly used in the fields like general machinery, pharmaceutical, manufacturing and semiconductor. In manufacturing field, *X-Y* ballscrew mechanism is